

1 Omar C. Jadwat (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Andre Segura (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
2 AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION  
FOUNDATION IMMIGRANTS'  
3 RIGHTS PROJECT  
125 Broad Street, 18<sup>th</sup> Floor  
4 New York, NY 10004  
Telephone: (212) 549-2660  
5 Facsimile: (212) 549-2654  
6 *ojadwat@aclu.org*  
*asegura@aclu.org*

Thomas A. Saenz (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Victor Viramontes (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL  
DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL FUND  
634 S. Spring Street, 11th Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90014  
Telephone: (213) 629-2512  
Facsimile: (213) 629-0266  
*tsaenz@maldef.org*  
*vviramontes@maldef.org*

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*  
*Additional Co-Counsel on Subsequent Pages*

7 Linton Joaquin (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Karen C. Tumlin (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
8 Nora A. Preciado (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Melissa S. Keaney (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
9 Alvaro M. Huerta (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Nicholás Espíritu (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
10 NATIONAL IMMIGRATION LAW  
CENTER  
11 3435 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1600  
Los Angeles, CA 90010  
12 Telephone: (213) 639-3900  
Facsimile: (213) 639-3911  
13 *joaquin@nilc.org*  
*tumlin@nilc.org*  
14 *preciado@nilc.org*  
*keaney@nilc.org*  
15 *huerta@nilc.org*  
*espiritu@nilc.org*

16 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
17 **FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**  
18

19 Valle del Sol, *et al.*,

20 Plaintiffs,

21 vs.

22 Michael B. Whiting, *et al.*

23 Defendants,

24 and

25 Doug Ducey, *et al.*,

26 Intervenor Defendants.  
27  
28

Case No. CV-10-01061-PHX-SRB

**JOINT CASE DISPOSITION**

- 1 Daniel J. Pochoda (SBA No. 021979)  
ACLU FOUNDATION OF ARIZONA  
2 3707 N. 7th Street, Suite 235  
Phoenix, Arizona 85014  
3 Telephone: (602) 650-1854  
Facsimile: (602) 650-1376  
4 *dPOCHODA@acluaz.org*
- 5 Marita Etcubañez (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
ASIAN AMERICANS ADVANCING  
6 JUSTICE - AAJC  
7 1140 Connecticut Avenue NW  
Suite 1200  
8 Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: (202) 296-2300  
9 Facsimile: (202) 296-2318  
*MEtcubanez@advancingjustice-aaajc.org*
- 10 Chris Newman (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
11 Jessica Karp Bansal (admitted *pro hac*  
*vice*)  
12 NATIONAL DAY LABOR  
ORGANIZING NETWORK  
13 675 S. Park View Street, Suite B  
Los Angeles, California 90057  
14 Telephone: (213) 380-2785  
Facsimile: (213) 380-2787  
15 *newman@ndlon.org*  
*jkarp@ndlon.org*
- 16 Nina Perales (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
17 MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL  
DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL  
18 FUND  
110 Broadway Street, Suite 300  
19 San Antonio, Texas 78205  
Telephone: (210) 224-5476  
20 Facsimile: (210) 224-5382  
*nperales@maldef.org*
- 21 Bradley S. Phillips+ (admitted *pro hac*  
*vice*)  
22 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP+  
23 355 South Grand Avenue, 35th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90071-1560  
24 Telephone: (213) 683-9100  
Facsimile: (213) 687-3702  
25 *Brad.Phillips@mto.com*
- 26 Cecillia D. Wang (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES  
UNION FOUNDATION IMMIGRANTS'  
RIGHTS PROJECT  
39 Drumm Street  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: (415) 343-0775  
Facsimile: (415) 395-0950  
*cwang@aclu.org*
- 27 Justin B. Cox (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES  
UNION FOUNDATION IMMIGRANTS'  
RIGHTS PROJECT  
1989 College Avenue  
Atlanta, GA 30317  
Telephone: 404.221.5854  
Facsimile: 404.221.5857  
*jcox@aclu.org*
- 28 Laboni A. Hoq (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
ASIAN AMERICANS ADVANCING  
JUSTICE – LOS ANGELES  
1145 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 200  
Los Angeles, California 90017  
Telephone: (213) 977-7500  
Facsimile: (213) 977-7595  
*lhoq@advancingjustice-la.org*
- Daniel R. Ortega, Jr., (SBA No. 005015)  
ORTEGA LAW FIRM, P.C.  
361 East Coronado Road  
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-1525  
Telephone: (602) 386-4455  
Facsimile: (602) 340-1896  
*danny@ortegalaw.com*
- Stephen P. Berzon++ (admitted *pro hac*  
*vice*)  
Jonathan Weissglass++ (admitted *pro hac*  
*vice*)  
ALTSHULER BERZON LLP++  
177 Post Street, Suite 300  
San Francisco, CA 94108  
Telephone: (415) 421-7151  
Facsimile: (415) 362-8064  
*sberzon@altshulerberzon.com*  
*jweissglass@altshulerberzon.com*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

+ *Attorneys for all plaintiffs except Service Employees International Union, Service Employees International Union, Local 5, and United Food and Commercial Workers International Union*

++ *Attorneys for Service Employees International Union, Service Employees International Union, Local 5, and United Food and Commercial Workers International Union*

1 Plaintiffs and Intervenor Defendants have conferred regarding the outstanding  
2 matters in this case and have reached agreement on a proposed disposition of the case. In  
3 the interest of the efficient resolution of this case, the Parties make the following  
4 representations and request that the Court enter the proposed final order.

5 The Parties have stipulated and agreed to resolve *Valle del Sol v. Whiting*, No. CV  
6 10-1061-PHX-SRB on the following terms:

7 First, as part of its agreement with Plaintiffs, Intervenor Defendants will issue the  
8 attached Informal Attorney General Opinion, which provides guidelines on the  
9 implementation of Senate Bill 1070's Section 2(b) and 2(d), among other sections. The  
10 Informal Attorney General Opinion reflects the State's interpretation of legal requirements  
11 and limitations for implementing Section 2(b) and 2(d). The Informal Attorney General  
12 Opinion is attached as Exhibit A.

13 Second, both parties stipulate that A.R.S. §§ 28-3511A (1)(d) and (e) should be  
14 enjoined, and ask this Court to enjoin those provisions. These are impoundment  
15 provisions that apply when there is a predicate offense under the "harboring,"  
16 "transporting," or "concealing" provisions codified at A.R.S. 13-2929, which have been  
17 enjoined in this litigation and a related case. *See Valle del Sol v. Whiting*, No. CV 10-  
18 1061-PHX-SRB, 2012 WL 8021265 (D. Ariz. Sept. 5, 2012) (preliminary injunction);  
19 *Valle del Sol Inc. v. Whiting*, 732 F.3d 1006 (9th Cir. 2013) (affirming preliminary  
20 injunction); *United States v. Arizona*, No. 2:10-cv-014013-SRB at Docket No. 200  
21 (permanent injunction). Thus, because there is no legal basis to enforce A.R.S. §§ 28-  
22 3511A(1)(d) and (e), the Parties stipulate that A.R.S. §§ 28-3511A(1)(d) and (e) should be  
23 permanently enjoined because it is unconstitutional.

24 Third, the Plaintiffs further settle any claim they have for attorneys' fees and costs  
25 related to this case, No. CV 10-1061-PHX-SRB, and all of its appeals for the sum of \$1.4  
26 million. Intervenor Defendants agree to pay \$1.4 million to Plaintiffs' Counsel to resolve  
27 any liability for attorneys' fees and costs from this case, No. CV 10-1061-PHX-SRB, and  
28 all of its appeals.

1 Fourth, upon approval by the Court of the proposed order filed herewith and the  
2 terms agreed to by the Parties, the Parties will not further challenge the Court's ruling at  
3 Docket No. 1285 or any other rulings in this litigation. *See* the Parties' joint request for  
4 dismissal without prejudice filed with the Ninth Circuit attached as Ex. B.

5  
6 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 15th day of September, 2016.

7  
8 By /s/ John R Lopez, IV w/ permission  
9 Arizona Attorney General's Office  
10 1275 W Washington Street  
11 Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2997

12 *Attorneys for Intervenor Defendant the*  
13 *State of Arizona*

14 and

15 By /s/ Michael Tryon w/ permission  
16 Arizona Attorney General's Office  
17 1275 West Washington Street  
18 Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2926

19 *Attorneys for Intervenor Defendant the*  
20 *State of Arizona*

21 By /s/ Victor Viramontes

22 Victor Viramontes  
23 Mexican American Legal Defense and  
24 Educational Fund  
25 634 S. Spring St., 11th Floor  
26 Los Angeles, California 90014

27 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

28 By /s/ Karen C. Tumlin w/ permission

Karen C. Tumlin  
National Immigration Law Center  
3435 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 2850  
Los Angeles, California 90010

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

By /s/ Cecillia D. Wang w/ permission

Cecillia D. Wang  
American Civil Liberties Union Foundation  
Immigrants' Rights Project  
39 Drumm Street  
San Francisco, California 94111

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on September 15, 2016, I electronically transmitted the foregoing Joint Case Disposition and any attached proposed order and exhibits to the Clerk’s Office using the CM/ECF System for filing and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to all ECF registrants in this matter.

DATED: September 15, 2016

/s/ Marco A. Gomez  
Marco A. Gomez